

- ⁹ Lauritsen, J., & Young, I. (1997). *The AIDS Cult — Essays on the Gay Health Crisis*. ASKLEPIOS; ISBN 0-943742-10-2.
- ¹⁰ Philippe Krynen, a French nurse working with AIDS orphans in Tanzania, cited in Celia Farber, "Out of Africa; Part One", Celia Farber, *Spin*, March 1993.
- ¹¹ See, for example, Bauer, H. H. (1992/1994/2005). *Scientific Literacy and the Myth of the Scientific Method*. University of Illinois Press.
- ¹² Duesberg, P. H. (1987). Retroviruses as carcinogens and pathogens: Expectations and reality. *Cancer Research*, 47, 1199–1220.
- ¹³ Crewdson, J. (2002). *Science Fictions: A Scientific Mystery, a Massive Cover-up and the Dark Legacy of Robert Gallo*. Little, Brown.
- ¹⁴ "Errors in Celia Farber's March 2006 article in Harper's Magazine", by (in alphabetical order by surname) Robert Gallo MD, Nathan Geffen, Gregg Gonsalves, Richard Jefferys, Daniel R. Kuritzkes MD, Bruce Mirken, John P. Moore PhD, Jeffrey T. Safrit PhD; final version: released 22 March 2006; available for instance at www.aegis.org/files/tac/2006/errorsinfarberarticle.html as recently as 25 April 2006.
- ¹⁵ www.niaid.nih.gov/factsheets/evidhiv.htm, accessed as recently as 19 April 2006.
- ¹⁶ A rebuttal to the NIAID/NIH document "The Evidence That HIV Causes AIDS", by Robert Johnston, Matthew Irwin, and David Crowe; available at <http://www.rethinkaids.info/body.cfm?id=1>, accessed as recently as 19 April 2006.

The Secret Vaults of Time: Psychic Archeology and the Quest for Man's Beginnings by Stephan A. Schwartz. Studies in Consciousness Series. Charlottesville, VA: Hampton Roads Publishing, 2005. 370 pp. \$17.95 (paper). ISBN 1-57174-431-2.

Stephan A. Schwartz is well-known within the parapsychological community not only for his contributions to experimental research on ESP in the form of remote viewing, but also for being one of the few bold enough to pursue the development of innovative practical applications of psychic (psi) phenomena in everyday life. Of note in the former case, he had been directly responsible in arranging for the use of a deep-dive submarine in an experiment exploring the spatial and environmental limits of remote viewing that was a part of a larger covert series of remote viewing studies carried out at Stanford Research Institute and funded by military intelligence agencies in the late 1970s. Despite being nearly 500 miles out from the target and several hundred feet below the surface of the Pacific Ocean, the two remote viewing subjects were still apparently able to accurately describe characteristics of the target site to a statistically significant degree in both of the two experimental trials (Puthoff et al., 1981: 51–57). Of note in the latter case, for nearly 20 years Schwartz had served as the chairman and research director of The Mobius Society, a Los Angeles-based research organization that in the 1980s had made contributions to the field of

archaeology by developing a workable remote viewing methodology and directly applying it to the search for both land- and marine-based archaeological sites in Egypt, Jamaica, Mexico, and the American Southwest (Schwartz, 1982; Schwartz & De Mattei, 1988). In one such application carried out in the Fall of 1987, the ESP information provided by a group of remote viewing subjects using a variation of the majority-vote technique had guided a research expedition team (of which The Mobius Society was a part) to locate the site of the American brig *Leander* that had been shipwrecked in the waters off of Beak's Cay in the Great Bahama Banks, despite the apparent failure of the more conventional archaeological methods of aerial survey, satellite imagery, metal detection, and proton-precession magnetometry scans to do so (Schwartz & De Mattei, 1989). Though there had been some controversy as to whether the discovery of the American brig had come about through psychic guidance or had possibly been a random find stumbled upon in an area with the potential for a number of sunken vessels to be in relatively close proximity to each other (Harary, 1990, 1992; Schwartz & De Mattei, 1990), the design of the study and the other field studies carried out by The Mobius Society seemed to nonetheless demonstrate the potential for applying psi in a way that may be of use to other disciplines, as well as demonstrate the potential for systematically studying psi in the field in a practical manner as a way to expand upon the limitations of the more rigorously controlled laboratory studies. *The Secret Vaults of Time*, originally published in 1978 as the first book in a trilogy by Schwartz on the topic of psychic archaeology, presents the historical background of ostensible psychically guided archaeological discoveries that laid the foundation for the move by Schwartz and The Mobius Society into this unique area of applied psi.

The book presents seven cases of psychic archaeology, with each being treated in detail within its own individual chapter. Chapter 1 presents the case of the psychically guided excavation of Glastonbury Abbey by Frederick Bligh Bond in the early 1900s. Bond, an architect by trade who specialized in medieval-Gothic church architecture and had an apparent personal interest in psychic phenomena, had developed a special affinity for the medieval abbey, and was intent on reconstructing its history through excavation of its ruins and grounds. It is not clear why Bond had turned to a psychic source as part of his effort, though the probable reasons (aside from his psychic interest) may have included his need to produce results in order to maintain his organizational and financial support for the excavation, as well as the indication that conventional means of excavation would be limited in providing results that could help answer the many questions still surrounding the abbey at the time (p. 12). His psychic source came through automatic writing, a form of motor automatism involving writing that is apparently done without the writer's full conscious awareness that it is being written, which dates back to the early days of psychical research (see Stevenson [1978] for a summarization of cases and issues). The first writing session Bond held was in his office in November 1907, with his friend Captain John Allen Bartlett present as co-participant (it seems that both

men had to be present for any of the writing to appear). A typical session would involve both men sitting at a table across from each other, a sheaf of foolscap between them, with Bond's right hand laid lightly over Bartlett's as his left steadied the paper beneath the tracing pencil. Bond would then ask questions to the air, and the writing would begin soon after, with the presumed source most often being the discarnate spirits of former monks of Glastonbury Abbey who collectively became known as the Company of Avalon. In addition to the monks, Bond and Bartlett were apparently able to receive some writing from other supposed spirits of individuals who had resided in or around Glastonbury during the medieval period, including knights, publicans, and even a town farmer. It was noticed that when a different personality appeared, the style and/or the form of the handwriting often changed.

In the first writing session, Bond's questioning for information about Glastonbury Abbey had initially produced not writing, but rather a crudely sketched outline plan of the cruciform shape of the abbey that was known to be fairly correct, followed by an outline of the abbey church that was recognizable, save for one thing—a widened east end that was not known to have existed. Bond asked for a better sketch of the church, and soon after the joined hands of Bond and Bartlett once again produced a plan of the abbey with this unfamiliar east end drawn in double lines, which the writing that followed identified as Edgar Chapel. This provided the first instance of ostensible psychically guided information which Bond later verified in late 1908 when he did indeed uncover a massive crosswall 31 feet long and the remaining outlines of a chapel at the east end of the abbey church. Later writings provided information that led to the uncovering by Bond of two large chapel towers at the west end of the abbey, an eggstone (a carved rock that is thought to have early Christian ceremonial significance), and a human skeleton found buried in a unique fashion (in no coffin, with its head cradled by a wooden headrest and a human skull set between its ankles). Later verification of information provided by the alleged spirits about the skeleton through ancient records revealed that, although not all of it matched the records, some lesser details (such as names provided) were consistent.

Chapters 2, 4, 5, and 6 all deal with psychometry (also known as object association or object reading), which involves gathering ESP impressions about a person by handling objects belonging to him or her (see Roll [2004] for an overview of psychometry studies). Chapter 2 presents the case of Stefan Ossowiecki, a Polish clairvoyant who performed psychometry on artifacts dating from ancient and prehistoric times as part of a series of psychic archaeology experiments designed by ethnologist Stanislaw Poniowski, which were carried out just before and during World War II. The kinds of artifacts used included a petrified foot taken from the mummy of an Ancient Egyptian female (pp. 75–76), a rock scraper and a stone club from the Middle Pleistocene Age (300,000 years ago) (pp. 84–86), and an engraving tool from the Magdalenian culture of the Upper Paleolithic (15,000–10,000 B.C.) (p. 100). Poniowski also recognized the need for an interdisciplinary approach to psychic archaeology,

and thus formed a group involved in the sessions that included an astronomer, a mathematician, a geophysicist, and an archeologist (p. 81).

In a psychometric session, the group would gather with Ossowiecki in the salon of his home in Warsaw. Ossowiecki would not be told anything about the artifact that would act as the psychometric object, nor would he be allowed to see it. He was also asked not to read anything related to archaeology or ethnology prior to the session. When asked about the conditions under which he would work, Ossowiecki often asked that the group direct their attention away from him, engaging themselves in light conversation on topics unrelated to the session or the target object. When asked by Poniatowski whether he could take questions while handling the object, Ossowiecki thought he could and would try. Detailed records on the session proceedings were kept by the group members throughout the session, and were subjected to majority consensus following the session to make sure that all involved agreed that the proceedings were accurate. A session would last for as long as Ossowiecki could handle the psychometric task, which apparently required considerable effort in concentration on his part, as he would frequently complain of feeling drained and tired afterward (pp. 82, 91).

Most of Ossowiecki's impressions could be described as resembling anecdotal witness observations, as though he were casually looking on a daily scene from the past (p. 86). Not only did he provide verbal details, but he also often asked for pencil and paper so that he could make simple sketches of what he was seeing. Though many of Ossowiecki's details on human physical appearance were not verifiable (since no overt physical features other than bone structure can be inferred from human remains dating from this time), Poniatowski found that where details were verifiable (such as in skull shape or descriptions of the kinds of animals that existed during the time), Ossowiecki was often accurate (pp. 86, 90–91). In some cases, Ossowiecki seems to have been able to describe the entire history of the artifact as it had been used by man, describing its first function as a utilitarian tool, to its next function as part of a house structure, then to its last function as a weapon, for example (p. 87). Ossowiecki even seemed to perceive scenes from the time that had a strong degree of emotion tied to them, including an Ancient Egyptian funeral procession (associated with the mummy foot, pp. 75–76) and even a primitive and emotionally charged act of sexual intercourse between a prehistoric man and woman (pp. 88–90). This seems consistent with the findings that suggest ESP most often involves events that have strong emotional impact, such as tragedies, illness, or death (e.g., Feather & Schmicker, 2005; Rhine, 1967; Sannwald, 1963; Schouten, 1982).

Chapter 4 describes the case of J. Norman Emerson, a prominent and highly respected Canadian professor of anthropology at the University of Toronto who took a bold open stance in support of psychic archaeology by actually applying it in his own studies of the Iroquois Indians in the 1970s. Emerson's position was motivated by the argument that although the archaeological record was capable of establishing the what, where, and when of human history, it was not often able to explain the meaning and value behind it. Emerson maintained that it was possible

to shed light on the latter using psychic information; to him, it provided a possible way to learn more fully and accurately about the human side of history (p. 138).

Partly influenced by his wife's fascination with the famed psychic Edgar Cayce, as well as the psychic archaeology work that W. H. C. Tenhaeff had carried out with the Dutch psychic Gerard Croiset at the Parapsychology Institute of the University of Utrecht (pp. 140–145), Emerson pursued psychometry experiments using Iroquois artifacts that were attempts to reconstruct and explain the past, in line with his position. His psychometrist was George McMullen, a man with apparent psychic abilities who he knew through his wife after she had met McMullen and his own wife through a Cayce study group. One experiment demonstrating reconstruction involved Emerson handing a little tapered clay cylinder to McMullen. After looking at it and feeling it for a moment, an "abstracted or disoriented" expression came across McMullen's face, and he then told Emerson that the cylinder was the stem of a prehistoric Iroquois smoking pipe that came from a site near Black Creek (on what is now modern-day Toronto) that dated from Middle Iroquois times. McMullen also provided an accurate description of its manufacture, and he made a sketch of the pipe as it had looked when fully intact, having a curved neck with a circular bowl at the end, which Emerson recognized as being consistent with Iroquois pipe bowls from the Middle period (pp. 147–148).

The psychometric source that McMullen used to gain ESP information did not always need to be an artifact; it could be a historical place, as well. In another experiment, Emerson brought McMullen to a prehistoric Iroquois site near Quackenbush, a village about 80 miles from Toronto. Emerson once provided a description of the method that McMullen would generally use in such field experiments: "George just sort of takes in the lay of the land, rapidly walking around, noting what is there today. Then he seems to become abstracted and begins talking about what he is seeing, which seems to be the site as it was a functioning Indian village" (p. 149). Emerson would also follow McMullen with a tape recorder, documenting McMullen's verbal descriptions as they went. McMullen's impressions that Indians of the site did not cultivate traditional Iroquois staple crops but rather traded with other Indians for them was at first thought to be contradictory to what was known about the site, but a pollen analysis conducted at the site later revealed no pollen traces for those staples, suggesting that McMullen may have been correct (pp. 149–150).

One of Emerson's experiments with McMullen also included a psychic "cross-check" approach. The artifact used was a carved piece of black argillite (a shale-like rock comparable to soapstone in hardness) that was nearly the size of a man's palm, which some thought may have been an unfinished pipe blank. When handed to McMullen, his impression was that the stone had been carved by a black man from Port-au-Prince, Haiti, who had been taken to British Columbia as part of the English slave trade and accepted by Indians there after escaping slavery. This was certainly not what had been expected about the piece; some, including Emerson, at first thought that it was unlikely enough to be

ridiculous (p. 152). When asked to "read" the artifact again, McMullen came up with the same impression and was certain that it truly represented the artifact's history. Assuming for the moment that McMullen was correct, Emerson went about using a number of psychics to "cross-check" McMullen's impressions, and through his wife's connections in the Cayce study group, he was able to gather impressions on the argillite artifact from several different psychics, all of whom had varying interpretations that centered on an African man in the slave trade as the carver of the artifact (pp. 154–155). Emerson's approach seems to reflect a primitive version of the majority-vote technique, a method used in parapsychological experiments to evaluate multiple psychic impressions on a single target. Emerson was also able to receive further verification of the psychics' impressions when he showed the argillite artifact to Allen Tyyska, a former student of his who had a short-term job with the Royal Ontario Museum cataloguing their collection of West African art. Tyyska confirmed that the artifact did indeed appear to be African, perhaps representing a "passport mask" that was commonly owned by West African males, only that it was made of argillite (which incidentally is native to British Columbia) rather than wood. On whether the psychics' impressions could be correct and considering that the artifact was a "passport mask," Tyyska replied: "I would entertain it very seriously" (p. 157). In addition, blood sampling analysis of British Columbia Indians by a team of physical anthropologists later showed evidence to suggest a black ancestry in individuals in one area (p. 157).

In Chapter 5, attempt was also made by Emerson and McMullen to help verify the archaeological predictions of another psychic, the famed Edgar Cayce. Hugh Lynn Cayce, chairman of the board of the Association for Research and Enlightenment (ARE) and the eldest son of Edgar Cayce, was impressed by the results of Emerson's psychometry studies with McMullen and approached them about testing his father's predictions regarding ancient Egyptian culture during an ARE-supported trip to Egypt in October 1975. During that trip, McMullen not only reported impressions of underground water systems in the area around the Giza Plateau as Cayce had predicted, but he also described the shape and dimensions of a sculpted crown that once stood on the head of the Great Sphinx, and had the impression that the Great Pyramid of Giza once had a capstone at its peak. The capstone impressions have yet to be verified or disproved, although there seemed to be at least some degree of correctness with regard to the Sphinx crown; a hole in the head of the Sphinx was discovered by Thomas Shaw sometime between 1720 and 1733, and stelae discovered at the base of the Sphinx give details on the size, shape, and position of the missing crown (pp. 191–193).

Chapter 6 also deals with historical sites as psychometric sources in the cases of Charles Garrad and C. S. Reid, two Canadian archaeologists who independently sought the use of psychics in their studies of historical Native American sites. Garrad's area of specialty was a single tribe of Indians known as the Wyandots (whose culture dates back to the 1600s), and his first field experiment was held at the site of what once was a principal Wyandot village named

Ehwaë in August 1973. He had brought with him psychic Sheila Conway, whom he had met through Emerson (he had once studied under Emerson early in his career). As she walked the woods surrounding the site, Conway could not only pick up basic surface impressions, but could reportedly see, smell, and hear the village as it was when it had been inhabited in the 1630s (pp. 203–204). Among her impressions, Conway's descriptions of healing rituals at the site were found to be consistent with modern-day research on Indian healing methods demonstrated by Chief Rolling Thunder, a Shoshone medicine man, carried out at the Menninger Clinic in Kansas (p. 205). She also described seeing important visitors to the site wearing woven grass capes, which was consistent with documented accounts by Samuel de Champlain of how the Indians had used grass in weaving (p. 206). At another Wyandot site, Conway was able to describe the appearance of a priest, the church he headed, and the log house that he had lived in, which was consistent with the site being the known location for a Jesuit church headed by a priest resembling Conway's description in the 1640s (pp. 208–210).

Reid, who had also once been a student of Emerson's, was attempting to excavate two Iroquois settlement sites in order to locate their structural foundations as part of his master's thesis. Unable to locate them after extensive trenching, and faced with low funding and a closing digging season, Reid finally asked Emerson about inviting McMullen to the sites to gather impressions on where to dig. Upon arriving at the sites, McMullen was apparently able to psychically trace the location of a settlement palisade (a wooden fence that surrounds a settlement) and its entrance, which was verified through trenching, and it was noted that McMullen's impressions were only inches off of their actual location when found (p. 218).

Chapter 7 similarly suggests a psychometric form of clairvoyance regarding buried artifacts in the case of Clarence Wolsey Weiant, who had gone to Mexico on a 1938–1939 expedition supported by the National Geographic Society and the Smithsonian to excavate a Meso-American Indian site outside the village of Tres Zapotes, about 50 miles from Vera Cruz. The excavation uncovered a giant stone head called the Cabeza Colosal, a stone tablet with what is thought to be the earliest recorded date in the New World (November 4, 291 B.C.), and a small "laughing" Indian figurine that provided evidence to indicate that Tres Zapotes had been the meeting point for three Meso-American Indian tribes: the Aztec, the Maya, and the Olmec. The story surrounding the discovery of the latter artifact seemed to have a psychic component. Like Reid, Weiant was facing the end of the digging season, so he was forced to choose only a few of the more than 50 mounds present at the Tres Zapotes site to excavate fully. He logically chose those closest to the location of the Cabeza Colosal, but very little of note was to be found within them. Then one evening, Weiant was approached by a man in his digging crew named Emilio Tegoma, who asked to speak with him. Weiant recalled of Tegoma, "He was an old man, the oldest man on the dig. From his historical remembrances, I would say he must have been well along in his eighties, and yet he dug right with the rest of the crew. Well, the old man saw that I was dis-

appointed, and after we had quit for the day, he came up to me and said that tomorrow, if I would shift the digging to where he told me, I would have results. I would find what I was looking for" (p. 226). Shifting the dig was a considerable risk because of the limited time left before the end of the season, but when Weiant again spoke with Tegoma the next morning, the old man assured him that he was able to see hidden things at a distance, and that he would be successful if he dug at the indicated spot. Having been familiar with psi phenomena through his position as an assistant to Hereward Carrington prior to his becoming an archaeologist (pp. 223–224), Weiant decided to follow the old man's clairvoyant impression and shifted the dig to the low mound the old man had indicated, located on a flood plain about two-thirds of a mile from where the giant head had been discovered. Weiant's crew began to dig, and "[w]ithin twenty minutes of the first shovelful, I knew the choice was a correct one, for in just those few moments the unbroken laughing figurine came out of the ground" (p. 228). This was only one of several psychically located digging areas that met with success at Tres Zapotes; guidance by Tegoma had also led to areas in which many pottery shards, U-shaped stone yokes, and some human remains were found (pp. 230–233).

Chapter 3 deals with the phenomenon of dowsing in the cases of James Scott Elliot and Aleksandr Ivanovich Pluzhnikov, two men who had independently applied dowsing techniques to archaeology in the 1970s. Elliot, a former general in the British Army, took up archaeology as a pursuit following his retirement from the military. Though Elliot recognized that there were many conventional methods of determining the location of archaeological sites for excavation, he did not think of many of them as reliable, and instead turned to the unconventional method of dowsing as a way to locate them.

There is an issue as to whether or not dowsing can rightfully be classified as a psi phenomenon. If dowsing mostly involves minute muscle movements in the arms and hands, and is therefore not necessarily a mental phenomenon, then the answer would be no. Alternatively, the behavior of the dowsing objects could be associated with natural responses to the presence of geophysical phenomena in the area being dowsed, such as localized shifts in the geomagnetic field or very weak seismic shifts (Devereux, 1990). For these reasons, dowsing is usually not formally defined as being within the scope of parapsychological study.

However, dowsing could be seen as being minimally related to psi if it were viewed as a form of motor automatism as defined by the psychological researcher Frederic W. H. Myers (1903: vol. 1, p. xv), akin to obtaining ESP information through automatic writing (as Bond had used; Chapter 1), pendulum swinging, or using a planchette on a Ouija board. The role of motor automatism in producing ESP impressions was studied empirically in a series of ESP card tests carried out by William G. Roll (1975), in which his subjects had used either a pendulum (pp. 262–265, 301–325) or an adaptation of the Ouija board (pp. 251, 254–256) to make ESP card calls, with moderate success. At least one aspect of Elliot's dowsing techniques may suggest unconscious ESP acting in the form of motor automatism.

This aspect is map dowsing. Usually dowsing is done on site in a localized area of space, where the resources or artifacts being sought are thought to be located. However, Elliot sometimes attempted to locate archaeological sites before moving on site by using his dowsing object (usually a pendulum in this case) over a map of the area, laid out on a table in his study. Elliot had used such a method to locate the foundations of houses that had once existed on the grounds of Swinbrook Cottage near Oxford, England, in September 1969 (pp. 116–119), as well as the remains of roads and ditches at Chieveley Manor in Berkshire that date back to the Iron Age (700 B.C.–400 A.D.) (p. 123). Presumably, if dowsing is solely the result of objects responding to localized geophysical conditions in the area of interest, then map dowsing should not be feasible because the individual is not in the area of interest when the dowsing is done (unless one considers the possibility that the location of Elliot's home has its own unique geophysical properties).

Though Elliot's dowsing techniques did not really catch the attention of professional archaeologists in Britain, the subject was viewed much more seriously in Russia. In that country, dowsing (which they called the Biophysical Effect, based on the academic work of Leonid Vasiliev, p. 129) was studied academically and utilized in locating natural geologic resources. Pluzhnikov, a Russian technical scientist and lecturer, undertook dowsing archeology studies with the support of several prominent Russian historical organizations such as the Scientific-Methodological Council for the Preservation of Cultural Monuments of the USSR Ministry of Culture (the Russian equivalent of the Smithsonian Institution), an approach to dowsing that was the direct opposite of that seen in America. Supported by a team of Russian archaeologists and historical architects, Pluzhnikov's "operators" (his term for dowsers) were able to map out the location of a major battle site in Russian history in the area outside of Borodino, a town west of Moscow. There, the Russians had defended against the French army led by Napoleon in September 1812 (pp. 130–133). To date, it remains to be one of the only openly academic approaches to dowsing that has existed.

Aside from setting the case foundation for pursuing the practical use of psychic archaeology, the value of the cases that Schwartz presents in *The Secret Vaults of Time* may be in what they can tell us about psychic perception of the past. Inherent in human experience of the past is memory; an individual must remember what he or she has experienced, so that he or she can learn from it in the present and prepare for the future. One interpretation of the saying "The past is prologue" bears on this, and the approach hints at a possible survival value for one's memory of the past. It may be the case as well that memory exists not only for remembering the past, but also for psychically perceiving it.

A theory linking memory with ESP has been previously proposed by William Roll (1966), wherein the ESP response consists of revived (long-term) memory traces. The memory record of individuals consists not only of experiences they have had, but also of people they know or have known, places they have visited,

and objects that they have interacted with. This retention aspect of memory primarily serves to guide behavior and aid in the interpretation of incoming stimuli from the sensory end-organs, but it also provides the pieces that will make up the ESP response. Through its connection with memory, ESP bridges the spatial and temporal gap between the percipient and the agent (or the target) (Roll, 1988).

Most of the cases presented by Schwartz in *The Secret Vaults of Time* suggest that the psychics are perceiving events that occurred in the past in association with a given artifact or historical site as though they were able to "remember" the events that occurred there, despite there being little to no sensory cues available to them from the object or the site, nor is there a living mind present to retain memories of the time being perceived. The question may then be "What are these psychics responding to, in the absence of cues or a living mind?" We may come to understand what may be at work here if we consider the possibility that objects and places are also able to retain something like memories or "traces" of the past.

The Oxford philosopher H. H. Price (1940) proposed just such an extension of memory to places in his concept of "place memory": "Instead of stretching our ordinary notions of sense-perception, we could stretch our ordinary notions of memory [*italics in original*]. We could say that memory is not just a property of living organisms, as we ordinarily think; but that it, or something essentially like it, is a property of every point in physical space . . . We could then suggest that these rudimentary 'place memories' can on occasion affect human minds telepathically, and this would be the explanation of Clairvoyance" (p. 384). Through this concept, Price (1939, 1940) was able to account for the phenomena of psychometry and veridical haunting apparitions.

If memory (including place memory) and ESP are linked, then we should see some of the characteristics of brain memory processes reflected in ESP impressions. Examinations of some of the findings of psychical researchers and modern-day parapsychological studies seem to provide evidence in support of this (Roll, 1966). Roll (1978) found that the psychometric impressions of Senora Maria Reyes de Z., aka. Mrs. Zierold (the subject of Gustav Pagenstecher's psychometry studies from the 1920s), of an object she handled while under hypnosis seemed to reflect the psychological "laws" of association that have been proposed for memory processes.

Some indication of this has also been found in the cases presented in *The Secret Vaults of Time*, which may support the involvement of place memory in the cases. Ossowiecki (Chapter 2) regularly described ancient scenes that had a great deal of emotion tied to them (e.g., pp. 75–76, 88–90), Gerard Croiset (Chapter 4, p. 143) described a violent ritual sacrifice associated with an animal bone, and Sheila Conway (Chapter 6, pp. 203–205) described the devastating impact of an illness epidemic on the Wyandot Indians when visiting the site of their settlement. These are similar to flashbulb memories (Brown & Kulik, 1977), which carry a great deal of emotional impact.

In some psychometry sessions, the history of either the artifact or its owner was recalled in chronological sequence. Ossowiecki described the succession of

hands a sealed package had passed through over time (Chapter 2, p. 71). He also described the chronological order of a stone's use as part of a hearth ring, as a part of a doorway, and as a weapon (p. 87). The number of psychics whom Emerson had shown the argillite carving to had each described different points in the life of its carver, from his life in Haiti, to his capture and selling into the slave trade, and finally to his life among the Indians of British Columbia, suggesting that each psychic was following the life of its carver (Chapter 4, pp. 155–156). On the ARE trip to Egypt (Chapter 5, p. 196), McMullen was able to place a collection of pottery shards in chronological order when presented with the task by an Iranian archaeologist, providing commentary on the period that each shard came from in the process (p. 196). This aspect, as demonstrated in these examples, appears to be similar on the surface to the process of sequential recall in human memory.

When retested with the same artifact by Poniatowski (Chapter 2), Ossowiecki gave impressions that were consistent with those that he had given for that artifact (which described a prehistoric cremation and burial) when first tested with it nearly three years before. Schwartz noted of this: "It is impossible to say what Poniatowski anticipated, but it is unlikely he expected what he got: an almost exact replay of the same cremation and burial. Ossowiecki, of course, knew nothing of the control, could hardly have remembered the earlier experiments, since he was untrained in lithics, and probably could not have recognized the tool [i.e., the artifact]—even if he had been able to remember exactly what he had said three years before" (p. 100). In another example of a psychic "cross-check" (Chapter 4), Emerson had several different psychics handle the black argillite carving, which McMullen said had been carved by the former Haitian black slave that had been accepted by Indians. When comparing their impressions, he was "... elated to find many similarities and reasonably few contradictions. If the stories were not the same, it was usually a case of one person seeing something the others did not, rather than fundamental disagreements" (p. 155). Schwartz goes on to note: "As Emerson reflected on this mass of data...he realized that 'no matter how preposterous George's original story sounded, I had heard not one but a whole list of other psychics read that same rock cold—no preparation or background of any kind, or even any knowledge that others had tried it—and to a person they had psychically reported the same facts. With the entire globe to pick from, they had all settled on the same area for [the former Haitian slave's] early years—northwest Africa, perhaps the Gold Coast; the same type of geography and vegetation ... and the same part of Canada for his escape and association with the Indians'" (p. 156). These two examples suggest that the psychics are responding to very similar, if not the same, memories of a significant event in the history of an artifact, which seems sensible if we assume that the same memory "traces" are associated with, or even retained by, the object.

There may be a few other lesser suggestions of place memory involvement in the other cases. While the regular dowsing approach may be due to geophysical influence (Devereux, 1990), the map dowsing techniques of Elliot and

Pluzhnikov (Chapter 3) may involve (largely unconscious) responses to place memory, which, rather than manifesting as images or sensations, instead act through subtle psychosomatic ESP responses to place memory that in turn influence the dowser's hands; in other words, such dowsing with maps may be seen as a kind of "body psi." Because of the issue of whether or not dowsing is a psi phenomenon, consideration of this is limited. The alleged "spirits" of Glastonbury Abbey that Bond had communicated with (Chapter 1) were all localized to the area surrounding the abbey and its nearby village. Such a geographic focusing effect has also been observed in cases of séance "drop-in" communicators and in cases suggestive of reincarnation (Roll, 1972, 1982), and may also suggest response to localized place memories.

In all, *The Secret Vaults of Time* is a highly detailed and very interesting book that seems to not only make the case for the practical use of psychic archaeology, but also possibly tell us something about retrocognition. The cases presented in the book mostly occur from the latter days of psychical research to the early beginnings of modern parapsychology, and should therefore be of interest to those interested in learning about or teaching the history of parapsychology. The value of the cases may be that they only add to the collection of evidence to suggest that human consciousness is not limited by spatial and temporal boundaries, and that, as Einstein once suggested, the distinction between past, present, and future may indeed only be a "stubbornly persistent illusion," at least to the view and reach of our own minds.

BRYAN J. WILLIAMS
University of New Mexico
Albuquerque, New Mexico
bwilliams74@hotmail.com

References

- Brown, R. & Kulik, J. (1977). Flashbulb memories. *Cognition*, 5, 73–99.
- Devereux, P. (1990). *Places of Power: Measuring the Secret Energy of Ancient Sites*. London: Blandford.
- Feather, S. R. & Schnicker, M. (2005). *The Gift: ESP, the Extraordinary Experiences of Ordinary People*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Harary, K. (1990). On "The Discovery of an American Brig." *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 84, 275–281.
- Harary, K. (1992). Response to reply of Schwartz and De Mattei to "On the Discovery of an American Brig." *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 86, 257–290.
- Myers, F. W. H. (1903). *Human Personality and Its Survival of Bodily Death*. London: Longman, Green, & Company.
- Price, H. H. (1939). Haunting and the "psychic ether" hypothesis: With some preliminary reflections on the present condition and possible future of psychical research. *Proceedings of the Society for Psychical Research*, 45, 307–343.
- Price, H. H. (1940). Some philosophical questions about telepathy and clairvoyance. *Philosophy*, 15, 363–385.
- Puthoff, H. E., Targ, R. & May, E. C. (1981). Experimental psi research: Implications for physics. In Jahn, R. G. (Ed.), *The Role of Consciousness in the Physical World* (pp. 37–86). AAAS Selected Symposium 57. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

- Rhine, L. E. (1967). *ESP in Life and Lab: Tracing Hidden Channels*. New York: Collier Books.
- Roll, W. G. (1966). ESP and memory. *International Journal of Neuropsychiatry*, 2, 505–521.
- Roll, W. G. (1972). Review of *A Series of 'Drop-In' Communicators* by Alan Gauld. *Journal of Parapsychology*, 36, 155–166.
- Roll, W. G. (1975). *Theory and Experiment in Psychical Research*. M.Litt thesis, Oxford University, 1959. New York: Amo Press.
- Roll, W. G. (1978). Hypnosis and object association. In Ebon, M. (Ed.), *The Signet Handbook of Parapsychology* (pp. 327–353). New York: Signet Books/New American Library.
- Roll, W. G. (1982). Memory, mediumship, and reincarnation. In Roll, W. G., Morris, R. L., & White, R. A. (Eds.), *Research in Parapsychology 1981* (pp. 182–184). Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.
- Roll, W. G. (1988). Psi and the phenomenology of memory. In Weiner, D. H., & Morris, R. L. (Eds.), *Research in Parapsychology 1987* (pp. 131–134). Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.
- Roll, W. G. (2004). Early studies on psychometry. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*, 18, 711–720.
- Sannwald, G. (1963). On the psychology of spontaneous paranormal phenomena. *International Journal of Parapsychology*, 5, 274–292.
- Schouten, S. A. (1982). Analyzing spontaneous cases: A replication based on the Rhine collection. *European Journal of Parapsychology*, 4, 113–158.
- Schwartz, S. A. (1982). Preliminary report on a prototype applied parapsychological methodology for utilization in archaeology, with a case report. In Roll, W. G., Morris, R. L., & White, R. A. (Eds.), *Research in Parapsychology 1981* (pp. 25–27). Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.
- Schwartz, S. A., & De Mattei, R. J. (1988). The caravel project. In Weiner, D. H., & Morris, R. L. (Eds.), *Research in Parapsychology 1987* (pp. 100–101). Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.
- Schwartz, S. A., & De Mattei, R. J. (1989). The discovery of an American brig: Fieldwork involving applied archaeological remote viewing. In Henkel, L. A., & Berger, R. E. (Eds.), *Research in Parapsychology 1988* (pp. 73–78). Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.
- Schwartz, S. A., & De Mattei, R. J. (1990). Response to Harary. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 84, 283–295.
- Swenson, I. (1978). Some comments on automatic writing. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 72, 315–332.

The Autobiographies of Eileen Garrett: My Life as a Search for the Meaning of Mediumship by Eileen Garrett. New York: Oquage, 1939.

Adventures in the Supernormal: A Personal Memoir by Eileen Garrett. New York: Garrett, 1949/1969.

Many Voices: The Autobiography of a Medium by Eileen Garrett. New York: Putnam, 1968. (A new edition of **Adventures in the Supernormal** has been published by Helix, 2002. i–xi + 234 pp. \$24 [paper]. ISBN: 1-931747-01-06. Helix is a division of the Parapsychology Foundation, New York [www.parapsychology.org]. The new edition has photographs of Garrett and reminiscences by parapsychologists whose careers she advanced, including John Beloff, Erlendur Haraldsson, Stanley Krippner, William Roll, Berthold Shwartz, Ian Stevenson, Montague Ullman, and Rhea White.)

Eileen Garrett had many talents. She was the founder and leader of the Parapsychology Foundation, a philanthropic, educational, and research center, which has played a major role in the field for many years; she was a medium and a subject for tests in ESP; and she was a writer and publisher.

Her autobiographies are interesting not only for what they tell about her life but also for what they say about psychic ability and how it may be developed. *My Life as a Search for the Meaning of Mediumship* is an account of her life and psychic development from age three until her 40s; *Adventures in the Supernormal: A*